

3<sup>rd</sup> September 2009



**Architecture+DesignScotland**  
Ailtearachd is Dealbhadh na h-Alba

Bakehouse Close  
146 Canongate  
Edinburgh EH8 8DD UK

[www.ads.org.uk](http://www.ads.org.uk)  
[info@ads.org.uk](mailto:info@ads.org.uk)

T +44 (0)131 556 6699  
F +44 (0)131 556 6633

Architecture and Design Scotland is incorporated under the Companies Act 1985 as a private limited Company, Company No SC267870.

Gareth Hoskins  
Gareth Hoskins Architects Ltd.  
Charlotte House  
78 Queen Street  
Glasgow  
G1 3DN

Dear Gareth

**ABS 18: Aberdeenshire – Balmedie – Trump International Golf Course and Resort Development at Menie House – Gareth Hoskins Architects – Pre Planning (Reserved Matters)**

Further to our meeting on 30<sup>th</sup> July 2009, and our subsequent letter to you of 18<sup>th</sup> August 2009, we write in response to a further presentation of the project by your colleagues, James Darwent and Thomas Bernatzky and Neil Hobday of Trump International Golf Links Scotland, to A+DS at a meeting on 24<sup>th</sup> August 2009 in Edinburgh. Sonya Galloway of Aberdeenshire Council was also present at the meeting.

In our previous letter we raised concerns with the option of placing a large volume of accommodation along the escarpment. We felt that this approach would create a wall of buildings that would dominate the skyline and the surrounding landscape and isolate the large body of the site from the sea views. We felt that such a linear approach was alien to the landscape, and that it would not be successful in place making terms.

We suggested that an iconic hotel building might be supported in principle, but that in order for such a proposition to be successful it should not compete with other similarly sized blocks in close proximity. We encouraged the design team to reconsider its form and layout, to maximise the number of rooms looking out to sea. We felt that the options that followed the site contours seemed to offer much more potential for creating spaces and places that worked with, rather than against, the typology of landscape, whilst maximising potential views from the front and rear of the site.

We are pleased to see the strategic move in redistributing the resort apartments to the rear of the site, offering the opportunity to create an iconic 'stand-alone' hotel on the escarpment. We support the principle of incorporating a tower element as part of the hotel, which we feel has the potential to create a unique and interesting response to the site. As the designs for the hotel develop, we would look to see its form respond more closely to the topographic and climatic conditions of the site, to create a building that is rooted in its time and place.

We welcome the way in which the resort villas have been arranged around existing topographical features at the north end of the site. As the designs develop it will be important to integrate the villas, landscape and road infrastructure, to ensure a unique and contemporary response to place, and avoid the creation of 'anywhere suburbia'. We reiterate the importance of developing the landscape for the entire site as early as possible, as part of a landscape masterplan and planting programme.

Since our last meeting we feel that the design for the resort has moved on very positively and we are pleased that, through exploring various options for the site, the client and their design team have

arrived at a conceptual layout that we believe holds great potential, and which lays firm foundations for the project to be taken forward to the next stage. We are also pleased that there is support within the Council for this approach. We look forward to seeing the designs when they are presented to a full A+DS panel later in the year, and prior to a full planning application being submitted.

A copy of this letter has been sent to Aberdeenshire Council.

Yours sincerely

A handwritten signature in cursive script, appearing to read "A. D. H. S.", followed by a period.

Head of Architecture

Encl.

Cc. Sonya Galloway, Aberdeenshire Council Planning Department  
Neil Hobday, Trump International Golf Links Scotland